

EXHIBIT 3

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: I was going to wind up passing today as well Vice Chair because my eyesight is just too blurry to do this.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Understood thank you Commissioner Wagner take care.

We are on to Commissioner Witjes.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES:

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Forgive me Commissioner Weiss.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: I guess I'm not real familiar with that area.

And I really do like you guys are from there.

You have done I think a pretty good job of moving stuff around, whether it's acceptable or not, that is another story.

But I guess I'd like you to continue doing it.

I would just assume pass and maybe when we get up in my area maybe I would have a little more comment.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Weiss.

Commissioner Curry do you have a hand? We can't hear you.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Are we speaking of the Detroit area?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: We are talking about the Detroit area that's right.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay I don't mind taking a shot at it.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay Commissioner Weiss since we are still at you would you like Commissioner Curry to help you? Trying to honor the rotation we are in or pass and Commissioner Curry we will get to you in about two turns and we will see how it goes, is that okay?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Sure.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay thank you so Commissioner Witjes back to you.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: I just have a question in regards to the districts and the adjustments that we have, are they at first glance VRA compliant?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: What we have gotten from Mr. Adelson as of yesterday I will try to summarize it I'm looking to see if my summary is accurate, we have two drafts so the ones I will call it the RAS right version that was, that is more VRA compliant and not totally.

And the one the first version that we drew is less VRA compliant.

I don't think we have sort of an actual check box as you are good.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Looking at the districts we have, how much thinner can they get and how much further can they extent out before they are one precinct or one actual voting precinct wide.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Right which I think you and Commissioner Curry I think would be able to help sort of like balance those communities of interest and say no we are going to as a Commission right we can under your direction we could essentially say we believe that this is the best that we are going to be able to do because of these

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

you know all the different factors that we are taking into consideration including the voting rights analysis and then ask for that sort of analysis to be or excuse me the partisan fairness to be run tomorrow.

That is the task is to sort of come to some kind of conclusion, understand why we are doing it.

And, yeah, justify leaving it or continuing to tweak and sorry Commissioner Witjes Commissioner Clark has a comment.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, when we start this mapping that Juanita is going to do.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: We are on Commissioner Witjes at this point.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Commissioner Witjes will do will we begin with the map may we finished with yesterday or the previous one we had done.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: That is up to Commissioner Witjes.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Yeah, I honestly think that I don't want to say they are the best districts that we can create.

But I do think they are decent at this particular point.

And I don't know the area.

So unfortunately when it comes to minute adjustments I'm going to have to pass because I don't know where to potentially make them.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Understood.

Thanks Commissioner Witjes.

Commissioner Clark we are to you.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Focusing just on Detroit area.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Because of the way we want to work today to use our time in order to actually have a partisan fairness we want to have a voting rights analysis first.

Because that is our first criteria in the Constitution, we want to have as much compliance regarding the voting rights as possible before we move to the fourth criteria which is partisan fairness so that is the task today is to in those districts in Detroit and with our VRA expert with us in the room today yes that is the task.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I may or some other Commissioner may have something outside of the Detroit area that we would want to deal with on the Voting Rights Act as well.

So just want to point that out.

I would for this area at this point I would rather pass and let Commissioner Curry you know she is very familiar with the area, have her.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thanks Commissioner Clark, Commissioner Curry we are to you.

And Commissioner Curry you were with us yesterday.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I think what we should be looking at now is communities of interest and if anyone in particular has something that they remembered like Ottawa when we went there and we looked at that like Midland, I mean, I don't think that we have enough time to go through you know, all of this and do every single thing at this time.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Back to you Curry and then Commissioner Lange.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Why did we come back to Detroit because pretty much the Voting Rights Act and everything was pretty much intact.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I think our analyst will get there and I want Commissioner Lange first.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I'm going to second what everybody is saying because once we have the analysis we may have to come back in and make changes any ways and changes after the hearings so if it's not broke at the moment, let's not mess it up anymore.

There was a lot of thought that went into it.

There was you know analysis, you know, not the in depth but there was analysis done and I don't want to screw up what we have now if there are other areas to focus on.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I think MC we ought to deal with Vice Chair we ought to deal with Ottawa.

We got so much information on that the other day.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay and you are welcome to do that.

I just want to make sure that our consultant here Bruce Adelson has an opportunity to speak go ahead Mr. Adelson.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Thank you Commissioner Rothorn.

You know I understand the discussion today.

And I understand that the you know the time constraints and the myriad issues that there are.

And I will reiterate what I said yesterday and previously.

Even if you look at these two as issues you have a District, District 6 that is 64% non-Hispanic Black voting age population.

Could you go down, please on the demographics, John? I want to look at District 18.

And you have District 18 that is almost 77% non-Hispanic Black voting age population. We've discussed that previously.

We've discussed that these numbers are well in access of what Dr. Handley analyzed. And in access of what I've advised the Commission.

So you know, the choice of what to look at, examine, adjust, of course is up to the Commission.

But those are two serious districts that have significantly more population than Dr. Handley recommended in her analysis.

And that she and I agree about.

We have discussed.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Mr. Adelson I'm going to ask you because we are all novices when it comes to the VRA and we can go online and read the comments that contradict a lot of what you say just as well as the next person.

So I've got a couple of specific questions that I just want you to make clear for me. So I know how to go forward.

I asked one question before about can it have a higher concentration if you're doing it for the right reasons say as to not split a community, to not split up? I had used the Bengali community about adding them in would cause the numbers to go up for the overall population African/American population, would that be okay because you're not trying to split? And then the second part to that question is if the I understand VRA becomes above other criteria but we have a criteria of community of interest so if we receive input of community of interest that says they absolutely do not want to be split and that drives up the African/American population, then is there leeway in that VRA because we are accommodating for a community of interest which is also part of our state Constitution? I understand that the Federal Constitution is above all, but is there leeway in our numbers if that's the case if these are drawn and the numbers come out the way they are because we are trying to take into consideration the other criteria?

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Thank you Commissioner Lange and your question goes right to the core of one aspect of redistricting there are competing values and there will be people who may be satisfied or not satisfied.

But the bottom line is that if keeping communities of interest, not splitting them, having them implicates the packing of minority voters, the dilution of minority voters then the number one criteria is the Federal criteria.

So I've certainly seen in my career that adding communities of interest may dilute minority voting strength, may create voting rights issues may pack minority communities, implicating the 14th amendments.

So the bottom line is the Federal criteria are the absolute priority.

And there may be communities of interest that are not able to be included in certain districts because they implicate Voting Rights Act problems.

Now I know yesterday we spent a lot of time uniting Bangla Town into two districts rather than the three they had put in previously.

I think that was a positive change and positive adjustment and that was an example of a community of interest minority community of interest being satisfied up to a point by responding to their concerns, not diluting their voting strength.

We looked at the Asian voting strength, Asian American voting strength in District 10.

We looked at it in District 2 so there are a lot of considerations on the board but the bottom line is if adding, not adding, splitting, not splitting a community of interest implicates the number one criterion which is Federal law and it does that in a negative, noncompliant way then it can't be done.

And that is something that I've seen before, advised many bodies about.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I understand that that may cause some level of uneasy and disappointment in people who are watching these hearings and are voters of Michigan.

But that's part of redistricting.

The Voting Rights Act and the U.S. Constitution say what they do.

And that has been my ongoing advice to the Commission.

Thank you.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Witjes? Then Commissioner Orton.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Based on advice of General Counsel this needs to be finalized and be reviewed so we can quote unquote start fixing it I move that we stop working on the house map and let it go in for analysis over the next two days so we can fix it next week.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay that was a motion and I just want to make sure that because I think the fixing there was a District 18 that I think needed to be quote unquote fixed.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: And 16.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: And 16.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Pardon me 6 and 18 specifically.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Yeah 6 and 18.

And then in District -- and I do think that Commissioner Eid pointed out there is a community of interest in Hamtramck in District 10 we might sort of try to pull into 2 just to comply and I don't think it's going to be a voting rights thing but that's meaning I think it's going to be okay but I just want to acknowledge that, that I think is where the spirit of fixing, it's in this map and it's District 18, District 16, and District 1.

No.

General Counsel please help.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: What I would recommend is that the Commissioner consider doing is for the active matrix to scroll starting with 1 and glance at the districts, anything that is higher than 40% for the Black voting age population and the population difference I mean just to glance at and just go down the list and then when we get to I anticipate number 6, number 18, and others that those quote unquote fixes can be dealt with and then this map can be ready for the partisan fairness analysis.

That would be my recommendation.

And if the Commission was desiring of having an alternate house map, then the map that is the product of this analysis could be used to start the clone for the new one.

But this would that changed.

Did you scroll John?

>> MR. MORGAN: Sorry I moved the two yesterday where we were comparing Commissioners Szetela's plan with the previously done plan and I was making this matrix show the combined so we could do what you described which is look at each individual District I can also bring it up in the active matrix.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you for that helpful direction General Counsel? It's Commissioner Curry's turn and so I want to acknowledge Commissioner Orton first and turn it back to you Commissioner Curry and direct of fixing 6 and 18 so yeah it will be your turn after Commissioner Orton Commissioner Curry.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So General Counsel I guess, I can't see you guys over there but I think we have been asking for specifics and the specific that I heard is that 6 and 18 need to be further unpacked? And you gave a number and 1 through all of them and if it's over a certain percent we need to look at that. So can you tell me again what that number was.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: My suggestion was and Mr. Morgan was very helpful with it, however the data is best displayed but that the Commission start with the data chart and look at the list starting with one and I would recommend anything with a higher than 40% Black voting age population be looked at.

This will also give the Commission an opportunity to look at their population numbers at this time and that way by the time we get to District 110 we will know this map is okay for -- to have Dr. Handley run the partisan fairness measures.

So that would be my recommendation is just scrolling down the data and if there is anything, again, that looks percentages that look kind of high, the Commission can take a closer look.

But again with the modifications that the Commission has made, again, looking at the current data percentages would be what I would recommend and then when we see those districts, we can address them and make sure that all of them are addressed is my goal.

By going through the chart in this fashion.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay so our Chair has returned.

So I'm going to turn it over to Chair Szetela and.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yep so, I will take over from here.

First, I'd like to remind everyone, take it off? Commissioner Woods were you going to ask me to remind everybody?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Yes.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: That is what I was about to do remind everybody we are required to wear masks in the building so if everybody could get their masks on, I would appreciate that.

This map we have open right now just so I'm oriented this is a full map we have of the full state with the changes I had suggested yesterday.

Is that.

>> MR. MORGAN: Yes, that's correct.

I made the changes as directed.

We stipulated I would do that.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I uploaded the plan and this is the same plan copied over to a new file for adjustments and working today.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Okay thank you for that orientation.

So it is Commissioner Curry's turn and so per General Counsel's request I think what she is suggesting we just go down the districts one by one and anything that is over 40% look if we can rebalance it so looking at the District numbers, I'm looking at number 2 would sort of be the first candidate can we rebalance because it's 57% African/American.

Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay so this has been said like three times but I'm confused now.

This map we are looking at, is in the map that we all came up with? Or is this the one that you redid?

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I believe from Mr. Morgan it is the map that we all did together outside of the Detroit area.

But it includes the changes I proposed yesterday for the VRA purposes so he folded my neighborhood changes into this map.

>> MR. MORGAN: That is correct from my understanding that is what I have in front of us.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Can we go look at those changes again to see if we all agree with that? I don't recall what that was.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Witjes?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Two things, no, actually just one thing.

We are supposed to be looking at the voting age population percentages, correct?

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I believe so.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Why is the minority column blank?

>> MR. MORGAN: It's going to be the inverse of the non-Hispanic white so I can give you that information.

It's the inverse of this.

So in this second District it's going to be 75.4.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Got it that is all I needed to know.

I can do that in my own head.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: You can also grab on your if you have it open pull it's an excel sheet so you can just pull it down.

So Commissioner Orton did you want to see the other map?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Remind me of the changes that you made.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: It was a lot of small tweaks.

I think probably easiest thing would be to pull up the old map and then put the shape file back over it because then you can see because I adjusted the borders of Dearborn,

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Dearborn Heights, Redford, Livonia and a bunch of small tweaks all the way up to get rid of what people were calling the bacon strip.

>> MR. MORGAN: The request is to show the districts 1 as a layer as a shape layer and then one being in the mapping software.

Okay so right now I have the adjusted plan on the screen.

So I can try to either go back to the previous one and show the adjusted as an outline or I can show the previous one as an outline on this map.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Whichever is quicker.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay just a moment.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: No one is seeing my hand but while we are waiting for him to do that so can I just have some further clarification.

So we are going to go through and we are going to look anything above 40% because we want to be make sure that the whole plan is VRA compliant.

Does that mean so this is a -- this is a densely populated minority population City so does that mean anything above 40% is not VRA compliant?

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Through the Chair to Commissioner Orton, yes, I think as you start again with the list at District 1 and look at that the Black VAP, if it's above that 40% particularly in the Metro Detroit area how that can be minimized and I know from the chart that Mr. Morgan had displayed Chairperson Szetela mentioned District 2 but it's also 6, 8 and 14 from that list.

But again looking at the chart, the data will enable you to verify the population deviation, look at the Black voting age population and proceed from there.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Does that make sense Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: No, not really.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I'm getting on board with Commissioner Orton here. I need some type, and I mean no disrespect but I need set boundaries on what we need to go.

It's going to make our job a lot easier so we are not guessing.

So if I could get something that said 35-45% if you stay within that you're good.

That is going to help me.

Especially in areas that we're not familiar with.

I think that's what Commissioner Orton and she can correct me if I'm wrong but I think we are looking for a direct guidance as far as an absolute number so help, please.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, Commissioner Lange that is my understanding of what we are looking for is we are trying to bring things between 35-40% because based on Dr. Handley's analysis of racially polarized voting that those percentages would enable minority candidates to elect their candidate of choice in the Metro Detroit area because it's so highly concentrated and so highly democratic.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

So that is sort of the sort of boundary line Mr. Adelson is encouraging us to bring the districts down to if we can.

I'm not necessarily sure we will be able to just given the density of the area but that is kind of what he is suggested we do is these Districts that are 59% African/American or 60% that we try to bring them closer to that 40%.

General Counsel did you have a comment?

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Thank you Madam Chair yes, I was going to highlight Dr. Handley's racial block voting analysis and offer to the Commission when you were drawing the original districts the range for Detroit was 35-40%, Oakland County was above 40%.

So it's based on the area you were in, that is why that's why I flagged the 40% to kind of go through and have that just as the identifier to use.

And then see what area you're in and then you can that will provide the further guidance.

So again the goal is looking at the chart the data chart that will show the equal population deviation, it will show the Black voting age population, and that will enable the Commission to go through line by line and flag any issues either with equal population or with the Black voting age and my recommendation again I know District 18 was one of them but rather than try to remember or call out which districts might need to be looked at my recommendation is that you start with number 1 on the chart and just look through the data to identify what districts would need to be adjusted even if you just make a list and then go back and start fixing them.

Was that helpful?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: It is now I'm looking for Dr. Handley's report again so thank you.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Why don't we make it simple and do what you suggested General Counsel and come up with a list.

I think that would be easy so Metro Detroit area and I'm just going to start writing this down so right now we have District two and John you want to go ahead.

>> MR. MORGAN: Since Commissioner Orton was still asking for a comparison of the boundaries of the two different plans, we also went through the exercise yesterday of showing the demographics of both of those two side by side.

So I could do that both like we have the spreadsheet on one view and then the map on the other.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: That would be helpful.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Madam Chair.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yes, Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: While we went on that my screen has went very foggy, fuzzy, I can't see people or whatever so if they can straighten that out camera men.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: We have fuzziness over here too so they are working on something.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Madam Chair Szetela said yes Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Before you sat down, they said something about someone I think it was either John or Bruce said that it was 18 and 6 or 18 and another number I think it was two they already had kind of brought that to our attention they were over packed and maybe we could look at those. So they only named two.

>> MR. MORGAN: Commissioner Curry this is John Morgan to answer your question it was District 18 and 6.

I think you should be able to see the screen with those districts.

And then also to Commissioner Orton's question, I think I'm showing the plan that was worked on before the adjustments from Commissioner Szetela.

And then Commissioner Szetela's adjustments are in the dark blue lines.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay great, I see it.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: So most of the changes are around the Livonia, Redford and Dearborn area so you see how it's minor adjustments to those changes and Dearborn I made the District more north south instead of east west.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY:

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: So I'm wondering where we are at.

I think John has got the map up so do we bring the spreadsheet up is that the idea next?

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I think Commissioner Orton is looking at the changes.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I'm just looking at it thank you.

Sorry my brain was done by the end of the day yesterday.

Okay thank you John.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Madam Chair.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Yes, General Counsel.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Very briefly again if the Commission wanted to preserve the collaborative map, if the Commission wanted to analyze Commissioner Szetela's map, the Commission decides the number of plans to publish. So if that was another way to move forward and I know you have I believe the house is the only map that we only have one plan on.

So that would also be again an option if the Commission wanted to move forward in that manner.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: So are you still looking at this Cynthia? Or are you okay so basically the goal of this was to target those VRA numbers because they were I had the paper yesterday but it's in my bag but they were originally 70% for 14, 15 and 17. So this brought it closer and a 15% drop.

And Mr. Adelson's suggestion yesterday is we try to take them down further.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Let me try to make an adjustment.

This is the theme based on African/American voting age population.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: What is that area under?

>> MR. MORGAN: This shows the thematic dots and the numbers, just the population.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: And we need to reduce that population by how much? It's over.

>> MR. MORGAN: Current population of District 18 is 76.7% African/American voting age population.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I think our goal Commissioner Curry is to reduce it.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: 40, 45.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Correct, yep.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay, then we need to try to give some of that possibly to Ferndale from what I can see.

>> MR. MORGAN: You're talking about possibly putting some of the African/American population from Detroit into the Ferndale District.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Possibly because they are only stepping foots away.

>> MR. MORGAN: This version, that's District 8.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Uh-huh and Hazel Park is quite a ways from all of that.

They are like really closer to 9, 10-Mile road or something.

Hazel Park is really not that affiliated or contiguous with 7-Mile, I can't see your words now, but Oak Park and Royal Oak and all that, Hazel Park is not contiguous with it that much.

Now, I am you all can see this map like I can.

So I'm you know either way we go with this h we are going to have to move something if we are over.

And what is in 8?

>> MR. MORGAN: Hazel Park, Ferndale then it comes down to Highland Park.

It's this area here.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Hazel Park is that I do not put Hazel Park with either Highland Park or Ferndale for some reason.

But I see it on the map.

But there's not a lot of contiguous at that, with that at all.

Even with the bell, what is that? The minority that's there in Highland Park? The Bangladesh.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Bangla Town is that what you mean?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm not even familiar with them being in Hazel Park and when they came to our open meetings, they did not even mention Hazel Park that much.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: You are doing that great.

If you stay in Detroit on Royal Oak area, do you think there is a significant white population that will help balance.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Ferndale is pretty and I think it's more white Ferndale so if we add some Black or minority there, that would probably kind of equal it out some.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: What about the pleasant ridge area like is that part of Ferndale or not part of Ferndale?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: No, it's kind of in their own.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Do you want to try that and see how it affects the numbers?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Juanita, we can't hear you and it looks like you are frozen.

Okay we lost her.

There she is.

Commissioner Curry? We couldn't hear you for a minute.

It looks like you are on mute.

You are still on mute Commissioner Curry and we still can't hear you.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I was saying that I was addressing that to Bruce Adelson.

Mr. Adelson, I was trying to think and I know pleasant ridge is white minority and I think they kind of want to stay like that but, maybe we can move some of Royal Oak.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: So I'm hearing you Commissioner Curry you're talking about yeah where a Black and white balance may not be helpful for the whole community, we have racially polarized voting in the state and recognize there are people that don't want to be together.

And that's kind of what I'm hearing is that pretty accurate?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: And I'm just thinking in pleasant ridge because I don't see that mixture there at all there hardly but I know there is probably a few minority people that are there.

In fact, I have seen one or two but it's so less that I mean it's like a little place that we leave people alone and let them do their thing there and nobody tries to move in that community or what but we are trying to depopulize in Detroit by moving them around. Do you guys got any suggestions?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: My one suggestion with pleasant ridge if you don't like that one.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Really okay let's try it and see.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I think it might not be a good fit with the rest of the District of 18.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I don't think it would be a good fit.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: You don't think it's a good fit.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

the first criteria and I think again I don't believe that we have to choose but we have to justify and recognize the cost if you will of our choice.

That's I think what we are doing here because Mr. As Commissioner Eid is doing what we are doing is we are trying it, we recognize that it's, yeah, it's painful and we have to try it because we do want to get these maps done the right way the first time and legally.

Was there Commissioner Witjes, please?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: But according to what you said earlier they are VRA compliant because you said one is VRA compliant and one is more VRA compliant so which is it? Because I don't know.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: General Counsel please.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: The data for number four or actually the District 18 is the one that I will use as the example that had 76.72% Black VAP would be considered a packed District so what we were trying to do is utilizing the racial bloc voting, which provided the Commission with the percentages by which the minority voting population would have the opportunity to elect their candidates of choice, you don't and in Detroit the current maps the analysis showed that the districts were packed up to you know 70%, 90%, some of the districts.

Which is shocking particularly when you get the RBV analysis that says the 35% or could elect a candidate of choice.

So I hope that was helpful in what the goal is.

So and I know a lot of our public commenters and in the portal, I've seen the maintaining the majority minority districts that the City currently has and again Dr. Handley's racial bloc voting analysis demonstrated that they are not necessarily that the ability to elect, the opportunity to elect can be preserved without having those types of districts.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: So for the moment Commissioner Eid take us into lunch please.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I will just continue to finish fixing this.

Those three neighborhoods above Grosse Pointe, yes, those can you take those and put them into District 4?

>> MR. MORGAN: That took too much.

Do you want me to just do one of those three?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: No assign all of it, all of those three neighborhoods then we will take off from elsewhere.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: If I'm not mistaken, they are a community of interest themselves and do a line with the points.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: At least with Grosse Pointe Farms which is included in there, that is in the map that you just showed.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Orton and Commissioner Eid and John but then Commissioner Orton then Commissioner Clark.

Sorry that was not very clear.

Commissioner Orton please proceed.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay, so before you did this, Commissioner Eid, the voting age Black population in District 4 was 41.2% which is quite a bit closer to the target that we are going for.

Now it's a lot higher.

So besides we split up the area we were trying to keep together.

So do we think it's an improvement?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Orton do you want a respond from Commissioner Eid there.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Or anyone.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I think that with how we had District -- you were just speaking of District number 6 correct or are you speaking of District 4?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: District 4 is substantially more out of the range than what we wanted.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I think John is bringing up that, right, what you were suggesting or saying Cynthia, right is that it was well the minority percentage for 4 but voting age was 41% Black Hispanic and now it's 58 and for District 6 it is significantly lower, yeah, so that is the question right Cynthia.

Like is it an improvement? Commissioner Eid do you want to try to analyze that or do you want Mr. Adelson or move to Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I think the purpose was to shift the Black voting age percentage from District 4 I'm sorry District 6 which was at 67% lower.

So now instead of having one District way over on the percent we Ned to hit we have two that are close both being around the 45-55% range which I think is a more in line with what we need to get than the 68% range it was at before.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Orton do you have a response.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I thought we were going 35-40% so they are both way out from what I'm thinking.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Mr. Adelson do you want to help us?

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: I do think it's a net improvement and that things are moving in the right direction.

Does that mean that you know we are necessarily finished with them? I would say, no. But I do think that as part of the overall process, yes, there is a net improvement because one of the questions that not a question but one thing to keep in mind is since this is a large urban City with concentrated population, we still may find that we cannot achieve the absolute sweet spot for every District.

I think that that's an aspirational goal.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

But I don't know that we can get there.

So for purposes of now, there is a net improvement and I think that as the process continues that I expect the improvements will continue.

Thank you.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Want me to move on to Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I was going to ask Bruce Adelson's opinion on it so.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Clark and Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: We were able to maintain a community of interest with Grosse Pointe Farms with Grosse Point and those adjacent neighborhoods that were submitted to us.

So I think that is also a positive.

While we had to split up all of the five Grosse Pointes from each other for the house map they are still together on the Senate map and the Congressional map.

While I really honestly don't like it, I think that if that is what we got to do to get to compliance that is what we got to do.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Thanks Commissioner Eid.

So I think that concludes your turn.

I think we've I this -- I think we are okay.

And Commissioner Kellom we are on to you.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Hello, okay, what other were needing tweaking? I know that there was a list.

I heard Chair Szetela call out the numbers and I'm also looking at the percentages but if you know them offhand.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: The point is we have a lot of districts high African/American percentages and going down the list and looking at ones that were high and try to bring them in the range of 35-40 so you can start with any District that is high.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Are you familiar with this spreadsheet John has brought up here.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes, MC I am.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Yeah, it was honestly just an effort to orient you.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes, no I've been listing.

What I'm asking to expedite it if we can call it a number because I have not been writing them down but I can scan for myself this that is easier and look at the percentage and figure it out that way.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I think it was number 18 that was the one that was high.

>> MR. MORGAN: That was adjusted by Commissioner Curry.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Curry did that one.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I think she was deciding between the District and I think it was 18.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: 2 and 18.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

But he said it's not that high considering so then I was going to stop my turn.

But then we got more hands so I'm going to stop talking and I want a specific direction in terms of what to do.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Commissioner Kellom, I don't want you to use the term direction but I will say I wish you and I continued our collaboration with District eight to further our compliance refinement.

And that the population that we will need to adjust from 8, that will you know obviously affect the connected districts.

But I think that -- my recommendation is you and I continue with eight to see how we can further improve the population for the balance of your turn if that is okay with you.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay Roth Commissioner Kellom I think Commissioner Eid may have a follow-up to that thought go ahead Commissioner Eid.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I think what is confusing everybody because it's definitely confusing me, I look at that number 53% that it's at now and it doesn't -- and this is more of a feeling, right, it does not feel that high compared to the population of the City itself.

Now I know our analysis has said that it only takes about 35-40% of Black voting age population to elect the candidate of choice for that community.

But I think my most basic question is: What is the highest percentage it can be to fend off legal challenges in the future? We might not be able to answer that now, but you know, examining that question and figuring out like what is the actual target we need to hit.

As you said earlier, we are not going to be able to get to 35-40 percent for every one of these Detroit districts I mean I don't see a way to do it.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: I think through the actions of Mr. Adelson and Kellom they will try to experiment and see if they can get it lower.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: I think to that point yes absolutely.

And to Commissioner Eid's point that one of the things to recall is one of the items that we discussed back in July when we discussed the racial gerrymandering and packing of districts.

The Supreme Court takes a District by District functional analysis approach. If the people in this area, which they can, can elect candidates of choice below 50%, then rhetorically how do you justify creating distributes that are over 50%.

So there is no like absolute magic bullet like you are guaranteed everything is cool.

But 53.85% yes, it's an improvement.

Yes, it is moving in the right direction.

But my feeling is that there is more to be done here.

Because I am low to just say creating 54, 55, 56% majority minority districts in an area that analysis is determined, Black voters can elect at percentages lower.

I'm not prepared to do that.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

So the axiom that Commissioner Rothhorn with all due respect kind of said in my head is try.

There is still more trying to do.

We are not at the end of the line yet.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay, I agree with that.

I just want so my understanding from the beginning when I looked at the number is I should get it lower especially because of the neighboring districts needed some adjusting any way.

So that's what I was aiming to do.

Bruce I'm ready.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: I'm with you.

I don't know the area as well as other people in the room but I'm with you.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: What I'm thinking to remove the population and look at the VAP this little area that kind of goes into District 2 can we Zoom in and let me see this neighborhood? Because I'm thinking of taking some of the lower part of 8 and putting that.

>> MR. MORGAN: This is Highland Park the Township within the City of Detroit that is a separate Township and Hamtramck, the cities that are inside Detroit.

So they are right here then the neighborhoods are around them.

And this is the boundary of eight and two.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Commissioner Kellom if I could also suggest there may be places to adjust to the north, north adjoining District is District 23.

Which I think has -- does not have a significant BVAP population so that is just the suggestion is another place to look for adjustments.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: And I need to make eight lower in population as well. I'm about 2600 over in eight.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Remember Commissioner Kellom the amount you're within the sweet spot with the deviation for a non-Congressional plan.

The percentages under 3%.

It is very common to have state legislative redistricting plans that have deviations above that.

And the Supreme Court has said that's fine.

As long as you're pursuing a legitimate interest the pursuit here is Voting Rights Act compliance, that has been recognized for decades.

Including during the last round of redistricting. As a legitimate pursuit.

So you're with the deviation right now, 2600 over, you're good.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Can I go over any more than that? A little bit over.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Yes, you can.

And.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Let me go to the north then and let me see what is happening.